

In Vitro Variability Among Isolates of Eight *Phytophthora* Species in Response to Phosphorous Acid

M. D. Coffey and L. A. Bower

Associate professor and staff research associate, Department of Plant Pathology, University of California, Riverside 92521.

This research was funded in part by a grant from the California Avocado Commission. We also acknowledge the assistance given by Jean Paviot and Doug Johnson of Rhône-Poulenc in this project.

The authors thank Jaswinder Grover for technical work and BettyAnn Merrill for typing the manuscript.

Accepted for publication 8 February 1984.

ABSTRACT

Coffey, M. D., and Bower, L. A. 1984. In vitro variability among isolates of eight *Phytophthora* species in response to phosphorous acid. *Phytopathology* 74:738-742.

The ED₅₀ values for inhibition of mycelial growth in vitro by phosphorous acid (H₃PO₃) ranged from 5.2 to 224.4 µg/ml for nine *Phytophthora* species. Among the most sensitive species were *P. citricola*, *P. citrophthora*, and *P. cinnamomi*. One of the most tolerant species was *P. megasperma* f. sp. *medicaginis*. At the extreme of the range, *P. infestans* from potato had an ED₅₀ value of 224.4 µg/ml. Even among a group of similarly sensitive isolates, it was possible to differentiate them at a species

level in terms of their growth response to H₃PO₃. Isolates of *P. citricola* from avocado were inhibited by 48.3–67.6%, and those of the A2 mating type of *P. cinnamomi* by 11.3–38.5%, in the presence of 5 µg/ml H₃PO₃. Isolates of *P. citrophthora* from citrus were inhibited 80.3–89.3%, compared with 27.9–58.8% for isolates of *P. parasitica* in the presence of 10 µg/ml H₃PO₃.

Additional key words: Alette, efosite-Al, fosetyl-Al, fosetyl-Na, fungicide, phosethyl-Al.

The fungicide fosetyl-Al (aluminum tris-*O*-ethyl phosphonate), which is produced as an 80% wettable powder formulation by Rhône-Poulenc Agrochimie of Lyon, France, under the trade name of Alette®, is active against many soilborne plant diseases caused by *Phytophthora* (1,6,17,23,24). Until recently, its mode of action in vivo was thought to involve primarily an alteration in host metabolism rendering the plant less susceptible to fungal attack (2,3,9,13–15,17,20,22,24). In part, this conclusion was reached because fosetyl-Al was found to have very low activity against mycelial growth of *Phytophthora* spp. in vitro (2–4, 10,18,19,21,22,24). In one study, however, it was observed that the ED₅₀ for linear mycelial growth of *Phytophthora citrophthora* (Smith & Smith) Leonian was only 56 µg/ml, although the equivalent ED₅₀ for *P. parasitica* Dastur was 929 µg/ml (10). Some significant in vitro activity has been detected at different points in the life cycle of several species of *Phytophthora* (4,10,21). For instance, sporangium formation in both *P. parasitica* and *P. citrophthora* was completely inhibited by fosetyl-Al at only 10 µg/ml (10). Similarly, with *P. cactorum* (Lebert & Cohn) Schroeter and *P. citricola* Sawada, concentrations of fosetyl-Al at 10–40 µg/ml were inhibitory to the formation of both sporangia and zoospores (4).

Recently a more critical examination of the effects of fosetyl-Al on mycelial growth of several *Phytophthora* species in vitro demonstrated that the phosphate content of the medium has an effect on activity (11). On a high-phosphate medium, fosetyl-Al caused only a slight inhibition of mycelial growth of two *Phytophthora* species. However, there was strong inhibition on a medium containing a low content of phosphate with ED₅₀ values for fosetyl-Al for several isolates of two *Phytophthora* species ranging from 45 to 54 µg/ml. Presumably high levels of phosphate could interfere with the uptake of fosetyl-Al by the fungus (11).

In plant tissues, fosetyl-Al is thought to degrade to phosphorous acid (H₃PO₃) (3,20,22,23). In vitro, H₃PO₃ was found to be much more active than fosetyl-Al against mycelial growth of several *Phytophthora* species and the phosphate content of the medium

had little or no effect on efficacy (11). H₃PO₃ appears to be the toxophore responsible for inhibition of *Phytophthora* species when host plants are treated with fosetyl-Al (11).

The purpose of this present study was to establish the in vitro sensitivities of isolates of eight *Phytophthora* species to H₃PO₃.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

In all the in vitro tests, H₃PO₃ and fosetyl-Na (sodium ethyl phosphonate) were added to agar media before autoclaving and the pH was adjusted to 6.2 with KOH. Fosetyl-Na was used in preference to fosetyl-Al since the latter causes a precipitation of aluminum hydroxide.

The solid media employed were either a modified Ribeiro's synthetic medium (16) containing 0.084 mM (with fosetyl-Na) or 0.84 mM KH₂PO₄ (with H₃PO₃) and no β-sitosterol (11), cornmeal agar, or rye-seed medium A (5). A 0.4-cm-diameter agar disk from an actively growing colony was used as the source of inoculum. Agar plates were incubated in the dark at 24 C, except those of *P. infestans* (Montagne) de Bary, which were incubated at 21 C. Radial linear growth was determined by measuring colony diameters at two positions on the fungal colony. Treatments were carried out in triplicate, and the experiments were repeated two times. Controls consisted of the same media without H₃PO₃ or fosetyl-Na. The levels of H₃PO₃ used were determined in preliminary experiments and selected because they allowed good differentiation of the various isolates being tested.

ED₅₀ values were calculated from linear regression lines obtained by plotting the percent inhibition of mycelial growth against the log concentration of H₃PO₃. The standard errors of the ED₅₀ values were calculated from a linear regression analysis of the H₃PO₃ dosage against the growth inhibition. The fungal isolates were selected from the collection of *Phytophthora* at the University of California, Riverside. These isolates had never been exposed to fosetyl-Al in the field.

RESULTS

A comparison of single isolates of *Phytophthora* demonstrated that the growth responses obtained with fosetyl-Na and H₃PO₃ were almost exactly parallel, although H₃PO₃ was much more inhibitory (Table 1). Consequently, further comparisons were carried out using H₃PO₃ only.

The publication costs of this article were defrayed in part by page charge payment. This article must therefore be hereby marked "advertisement" in accordance with 18 U.S.C. § 1734 solely to indicate this fact.

TABLE 1. Inhibition of radial growth of an isolate of four *Phytophthora* species on a modified Ribeiro's medium amended with either fosetyl-Na or phosphorous acid (H₃PO₃)^w

| Species | Isolate | Inhibition (%) ^x of radial growth by fosetyl-Na at (µg/ml): | | | ED ₅₀ values (µg/ml) | |
|----------------------|---------|--|--------|--------|---------------------------------|---|
| | | 80.5 | 241.0 | 482.0 | Fosetyl-Na | H ₃ PO ₃ ^y |
| <i>P. citricola</i> | P1273 | 56.0 a ^z | 79.4 a | 92.2 a | 82.0 | 7.0 |
| <i>P. cinnamomi</i> | Pc402 | 24.5 b | 52.7 b | 76.4 b | 202.8 | 11.9 |
| <i>P. capsici</i> | P1319 | 23.6 b | 37.5 c | 62.9 c | 310.5 | 34.7 |
| <i>P. parasitica</i> | M134 | 21.5 b | 43.0 c | 59.5 c | 314.1 | 30.9 |

^wThe medium at pH 6.2 contained 0.084 mM KH₂PO₄, no β-sitosterol, and the growth was measured at 4 days.

^xInhibition based on comparison to unamended medium.

^yThe ED₅₀ values for H₃PO₃ are taken from Table 8.

^zMeans with the same letter are not significantly different (*P* = 0.05) according to Duncan's new multiple range test.

TABLE 2. In vitro responses to phosphorous acid (H₃PO₃) among isolates of *Phytophthora cinnamomi* and *P. citricola* from avocado and other hosts^x

| <i>Phytophthora</i> species and mating type | Isolate | Host | Inhibition (%) ^y of radial growth by H ₃ PO ₃ at 5 µg/ml | |
|---|---------|------------------|---|---------|
| <i>P. citricola</i> | P475 | Avocado | 67.6 a ^z | |
| | P1287 | Avocado | 64.8 a | |
| | P1273 | Avocado | 57.3 b | |
| | P602 | Avocado | 53.8 b | |
| | P1277 | Avocado | 48.3 c | |
| <i>P. cinnamomi</i> | A2 | <i>Juniperus</i> | 44.8 c | |
| | A2 | Avocado | 38.5 d | |
| | A2 | Pc289 | <i>Cedrus</i> | 30.4 e |
| | A1 | Pc300 | <i>Camellia</i> | 25.4 f |
| | A2 | Pc356 | Avocado | 22.6 fg |
| | A2 | Pc311 | Avocado | 22.5 fg |
| | A1 | Pc21 | <i>Camellia</i> | 18.8 g |
| | A2 | Pc336 | Avocado | 18.8 g |
| | A2 | Pc402 | Avocado | 11.3 h |
| | A1 | Pc271 | <i>Banksia</i> | 6.3 i |
| | A1 | Pc97 | <i>Camellia</i> | 0.0 j |
| | A1 | Pc138 | Avocado | 0.0 j |

^xThe medium at pH 6.2 contained 0.84 mM KH₂PO₄, no β-sitosterol, and the growth was measured at 7 days.

^yInhibition based on comparison to unamended medium.

^zMeans with the same letter are not significantly different (*P* = 0.05) according to Duncan's new multiple range test.

TABLE 3. In vitro responses to phosphorous acid (H₃PO₃) among isolates of *Phytophthora citrophthora* and *P. parasitica* grown on a modified Ribeiro's medium^x

| <i>Phytophthora</i> species | Isolate | Host | Inhibition (%) ^y of radial growth by H ₃ PO ₃ at 10 µg/ml |
|-----------------------------|----------------------|--------|--|
| <i>P. citrophthora</i> | M143 | Citrus | 89.3 a ^z |
| | P1163 | Citrus | 87.1 ab |
| | M132 | Citrus | 85.1 ab |
| | M117 | Citrus | 84.9 ab |
| | M142 | Citrus | 84.1 ab |
| | P776 | Cacao | 82.0 ab |
| | M131 | Citrus | 80.3 b |
| | <i>P. parasitica</i> | T131 | Citrus |
| M114 | | Citrus | 41.5 d |
| M141 | | Citrus | 30.8 e |
| M134 | | Citrus | 30.6 e |
| M152 | | Citrus | 27.9 e |

^xThe medium at pH 6.2 contained 0.84 mM KH₂PO₄, no β-sitosterol, and the growth was measured at 7 days.

^yInhibition based on comparison to unamended medium.

^zMeans with the same letter are not significantly different (*P* = 0.05) according to Duncan's new multiple range test.

TABLE 4. In vitro responses to phosphorous acid (H₃PO₃) among isolates of *Phytophthora megasperma* from different hosts grown on rye-seed medium^w

| Isolate | Host | Origin | Inhibition (%) ^v of radial growth by H ₃ PO ₃ at: | |
|---------------------------|------------------|-------------|--|---------------------|
| | | | 20 µg/ml | 50 µg/ml |
| P405 | Soybean | Mississippi | 61.9 a ^z | 82.6 a ^z |
| P1139 | Soybean | Wisconsin | 53.1 b | 79.0 a |
| P1258 | <i>Ficus</i> | New Guinea | 45.0 c | 53.8 b |
| P1057 | Alfalfa | California | 34.7 d | 51.3 b |
| D1-304 ^w | Douglas-fir (D1) | Oregon | 26.7 e | 36.7 c |
| D1-306 ^w | Douglas-fir (D1) | Oregon | 26.3 e | 33.8 c |
| D2-C17 ^x | Douglas-fir (D2) | Oregon | 15.0 f | 13.3 ef |
| AL2-508 (2A) ^y | Alfalfa (AL2) | Oregon | 11.8 fg | 11.8 f |
| P1253 | Chick-pea | Australia | 6.3 gh | 14.8 ef |
| P844 | Alfalfa | California | 2.2 hi | 23.2 d |
| AL2-509 (3B) ^y | Alfalfa (AL2) | Oregon | 0.0 hi | 0.0 g |
| P147 | Sugar cane | Louisiana | -1.5 i | 20.3 de |

^wRye-seed medium A, pH 6.2 (5).

^vThe growth was measured at 5 days. Inhibition based on comparison to unamended medium.

^wDouglas-fir group one isolate.

^xDouglas-fir group two isolates.

^yAlfalfa group two isolates according to Hansen and Hamm (13).

^zMeans with the same letter are not significantly different (*P* = 0.05) according to Duncan's new multiple range test.

TABLE 5. In vitro responses to phosphorous acid (H₃PO₃) among isolates of *Phytophthora megasperma* f. sp. *glycinea* and f. sp. *medicaginis* from alfalfa, soybean, and chick-pea^x

| Isolate | Host | Origin | Inhibition (%) ^y of radial growth by H ₃ PO ₃ at 20 µg/ml |
|---------|-----------|-------------|--|
| P1139 | Soybean | Wisconsin | 61.8 a ^z |
| P509 | Soybean | Mississippi | 45.9 b |
| P406 | Soybean | Mississippi | 45.3 b |
| P506 | Soybean | Mississippi | 38.5 c |
| P510 | Soybean | Mississippi | 37.2 c |
| P405 | Soybean | Mississippi | 27.9 d |
| P1057 | Alfalfa | California | 27.9 d |
| P1253 | Chick-pea | Australia | 14.9 e |
| 1133-2 | Alfalfa | California | 12.1 e |
| P1316 | Alfalfa | California | 9.1 ef |
| 1129-4 | Alfalfa | California | 7.1 f |
| P127 | Alfalfa | Australia | -13.6 g |

^xIsolates were grown at 24 C on rye-seed medium A at pH 6.2 (5).

^yInhibition based on comparison to unamended medium.

^zMeans with the same letter are not significantly different (*P* = 0.05) according to Duncan's new multiple range test.

The growth inhibition of 12 isolates, including six from avocado (*Persea americana* Mill.), of *P. cinnamomi* Rands A1 and A2 mating types (25) ranged from 0 to 44.8% with 5 µg/ml H₃PO₃ compared to unamended media (Table 2). Five isolates of *P. citricola* from avocado were more strongly inhibited (Table 2).

Isolates of *P. parasitica* and *P. citrophthora* from citrus were compared for mycelial growth responses to H₃PO₃. *P. citrophthora* had a narrow range of inhibition from 80.3 to 89.3%, whereas isolates of *P. parasitica* were less inhibited (27.9–58.8%) (Table 3).

A definite pattern of responses emerged among a limited number of isolates considered representative of different groups of *P. megasperma* (Drechs.) (Table 4). Two soybean isolates (*P. megasperma* Drechs. f. sp. *glycinea* Kuan & Erwin) were the most sensitive to H₃PO₃ at 20 µg/ml. The two isolates from Douglas-fir (13) responded similarly. Two isolates of *P. megasperma* Drechs. f. sp. *medicaginis* Kuan & Erwin, one from chick-pea (P1253), and the other from alfalfa (P844) also demonstrated similar tolerance to H₃PO₃ at 20 µg/ml (Table 4).

A closer examination of in vitro responses of a larger number of isolates of *P. megasperma* from soybean (f. sp. *glycinea*) and alfalfa (f. sp. *medicaginis*) revealed a tendency toward separation of the types based on their host origin (Table 5), but in some instances their responses were similar.

A limited study of isolates of *Phytophthora* spp. from cacao (*Theobroma cacao* L.) showed some differential responses. *P. palmivora* (Butler) Butler isolates were usually most sensitive to H₃PO₃, *P. capsici* (Leonian) isolates were much more tolerant, and *P. citrophthora* was intermediate in sensitivity (Table 6). There was, however, some overlap among the three species, with an

TABLE 6. In vitro responses to phosphorous acid (H₃PO₃) among isolates^a of *Phytophthora* species from cacao

| Species | Isolate | Origin | Inhibition (%) ^b of radial growth by H ₃ PO ₃ at 10 µg/ml |
|------------------------|---------|----------|--|
| <i>P. palmivora</i> | P922 | Malaysia | 81.4 a ^c |
| <i>P. palmivora</i> | P832 | Trinidad | 78.5 b |
| <i>P. palmivora</i> | P1020 | Nigeria | 73.6 c |
| <i>P. citrophthora</i> | P1213 | Brazil | 56.7 d |
| <i>P. citrophthora</i> | P1212 | Brazil | 56.1 d |
| <i>P. palmivora</i> | P736 | Ghana | 53.0 e |
| <i>P. citrophthora</i> | P776 | Brazil | 43.6 f |
| <i>P. citrophthora</i> | P1201 | Brazil | 40.1 g |
| <i>P. capsici</i> | P782 | Cameroun | 30.9 h |
| <i>P. capsici</i> | P632 | Brazil | 20.5 i |
| <i>P. capsici</i> | P1195 | Mexico | -0.85 j |

^a Isolates were grown on Difco cornmeal agar at 24 C.

^b The growth was measured at 4 days. Inhibition based on comparison to unamended medium.

^c Means with the same letter are not significantly different ($P = 0.05$) according to Duncan's new multiple range test.

TABLE 7. In vitro responses to phosphorous acid (H₃PO₃) among A1 mating type isolates of *Phytophthora infestans*^a

| Isolate | Origin | Inhibition (%) ^b of radial growth by H ₃ PO ₃ at 200 µg/ml |
|---------|----------|---|
| P1297 | Ireland | 71.2 a ^c |
| P4 | Mexico | 69.0 ab |
| P1296 | Ireland | 67.1 ab |
| P1298 | Wales | 63.5 abc |
| M3 | Mexico | 61.0 abc |
| P1293 | Scotland | 57.6 bc |
| M4 | Mexico | 57.1 bc |
| P1300 | Wales | 52.9 c |
| P1295 | Scotland | 40.3 d |
| 65 | Mexico | 30.4 d |

^a Isolates were grown on rye-seed medium A at 21 C (5).

^b The growth was measured at 7 days. Inhibition based on comparison to unamended medium.

^c Means with the same letter are not significantly different ($P = 0.05$) according to Duncan's new multiple range test.

isolate of *P. palmivora* (P736) responding similarly to *P. citrophthora* (Table 6).

All ten A1 isolates of *P. infestans* tested were extremely insensitive to H₃PO₃ compared to isolates of the other *Phytophthora* species tested. At least 200 µg of H₃PO₃ per milliliter was required to obtain any significant growth inhibition of *P. infestans* (Table 7).

The ED₅₀ values for isolates of nine *Phytophthora* species from different hosts were calculated (Table 8) from their dosage-response curves (Fig. 1). Values for isolates grown on the synthetic medium ranged from a low of 5.2 µg/ml for an isolate of *P. citrophthora* to 91.2 µg/ml for a chick-pea isolate of *P. megasperma* f. sp. *medicaginis* (Table 8). On rye-seed medium, the ED₅₀ for an isolate of *P. megasperma* f. sp. *medicaginis* (P1316) was 88.9 µg/ml, while an isolate of *P. infestans* had an ED₅₀ value of 224.4 µg/ml (Table 8).

Slopes of the dosage-response curves (Fig. 1) indicate that two isolates of *P. citricola* were the most sensitive to H₃PO₃, closely followed by two isolates of *P. citrophthora* from citrus and by two isolates of *P. cinnamomi* from avocado. Among the most insensitive isolates were a *P. cactorum* isolated from *Rhaphiolepis indica*, a *P. megasperma* from chick-pea, and isolate P1257 of *P. boehmeriae*.

DISCUSSION

Fosetyl-Al has been shown to provide excellent control of a number of soilborne plant diseases caused by *Phytophthora* (1,6,23,24), because foliar applications provide systemic protection through its strong basipetal mobility (1,17,24). However, this fungicide has not controlled potato late blight caused by *P. infestans* (1,17,23).

Fosetyl-Al was believed to have little in vitro activity against *Phytophthora* because ED₅₀ values frequently were found to be 500–1,000 µg/ml or even greater (2,10,17–19,23,24). Recently, much greater activity was demonstrated by using a synthetic medium that was low in phosphate (0.084 mM KH₂PO₄); ED₅₀ values of 45–54 µg/ml were obtained for several isolates of two *Phytophthora* species (11). In addition, it was determined that H₃PO₃ was 6–14 times more active than fosetyl-Al in inhibiting mycelial growth.

The present study established closely parallel effects of fosetyl-Na and H₃PO₃ on mycelial growth of four isolates of *Phytophthora*. It also confirmed the greater sensitivity of *Phytophthora* spp. to H₃PO₃ compared to fosetyl-Na.

TABLE 8. ED₅₀ values^a for inhibition of radial growth expressed in micrograms per milliliter for individual isolates of nine *Phytophthora* species varying in response to phosphorous acid (H₃PO₃)

| Species | Isolate | ED ₅₀ (µg/ml) | Standard deviation ^b |
|--|--------------------|--------------------------|---------------------------------|
| <i>P. citrophthora</i> | M143 | 5.2 | ± 3.7 |
| <i>P. citricola</i> | P1287 | 6.8 | ± 1.1 |
| <i>P. citricola</i> | P1273 | 7.0 | ± 1.7 |
| <i>P. cinnamomi</i> A1 | Pc97 | 9.0 | ± 0.9 |
| <i>P. cinnamomi</i> A2 | Pc356 | 9.9 | ± 1.6 |
| <i>P. citrophthora</i> | P1163 | 10.4 | ± 2.7 |
| <i>P. cinnamomi</i> A2 | Pc402 | 11.9 | ± 0.7 |
| <i>P. capsici</i> | P1091 | 18.5 | ± 0.9 |
| <i>P. megasperma</i> f. sp. <i>glycinea</i> | P405 | 22.3 | ± 2.6 |
| <i>P. capsici</i> | P1314 | 30.6 | ± 1.5 |
| <i>P. parasitica</i> | M134 | 30.9 | ± 2.3 |
| <i>P. capsici</i> | P1319 | 34.7 | ± 4.8 |
| <i>P. boehmeriae</i> | P1257 | 40.6 | ± 8.3 |
| <i>P. cactorum</i> | P1235 | 67.1 | ± 11.6 |
| <i>P. megasperma</i> (chick-pea) | P1253 | 91.2 | ± 69.0 |
| <i>P. megasperma</i> f. sp. <i>medicaginis</i> | P1316 ^c | 88.9 | ± 14.8 |
| <i>P. infestans</i> | P1300 ^c | 224.4 | ± 10.8 |

^a Isolates of *Phytophthora* grown on modified Ribeiro's medium.

^b Mean ± standard deviation of the mean based on a linear regression of the response (percent mycelial inhibition) plotted against the dosage (log concentration H₃PO₃).

^c These isolates were grown on cleared rye-seed medium.

23. Williams, D. J., Beach, B. G. W., Horrière, D., and Marechal, G. 1977. LS 74-783, a new systemic fungicide with activity against phycomycete diseases. Pages 565-573 in: Proc. Br. Crop Prot. Conf., Pests and Diseases Section, 1977. 1045 pp.
24. Zentmyer, G. A. 1979. Effect of physical factors, host resistance and fungicides on root infection at the soil-root interface. Pages 315-328 in: The Soil-Root Interface. J. L. Harley and R. Scott-Russell, eds. Academic Press, London. 448 pp.
25. Zentmyer, G. A. 1983. The world of *Phytophthora*. Pages 1-7 in: *Phytophthora: Its Biology, Taxonomy, Ecology, and Pathology*. D. C. Erwin, S. Bartnicki-Garcia, and P. H. Tsao, eds. Am. Phytopathol. Soc., St. Paul, MN.